**CONFIRMED MINUTES**

**JUNE 20-23, 2016**

**LONDON, UNITED KINGDOM**

**These minutes are not final until confirmed by the Task Group in writing or by vote at a subsequent meeting. Information herein does not constitute a communication or recommendation from the Task Group and shall not be considered as such by any agency.**

**MONDAY, JUNE 20, 2016 to THURSDAY, JUNE 23, 2016**

# OPENING COMMENTS – CLOSED/OPEN

## Call to Order / Quorum Check

The Materials Testing Laboratories (MTL) Task Group was called to order at 9:00 a.m., 20-Jun-2016.

It was verified that only SUBSCRIBER MEMBERS were in attendance during the closed portion of the meeting.

A quorum was established with the following representatives in attendance:

***Subscriber Members/Participants Present (\* Indicates Voting Member)***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | NAME |  | COMPANY NAME |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| \* | Shamim | Abbas | The Boeing Company |  |
|  | Hal | Abel | Raytheon Co. |  |
| \* | David | Bale | UTC Pratt and Whitney |  |
| \* | Christine | Brassine | SAFRAN Group |  |
| \* | David | Cordova | Rockwell Collins, Inc. |  |
| \* | Claudia | Granados Torres | Honeywell Aerospace | Secretary |
| \* | Dan | Graves | UTC Aerospace (Goodrich) | Vice Chairperson |
|  | Karen | Kim | Sikorsky – Lockheed Martin |  |
|  | Nick | Magnapera | BAE Systems – E & I |  |
| \* | Raul | Olmo Mora | Airbus |  |
|  | Alan | Paneccasio | UTC Pratt and Whitney |  |
| \* | Amanda | Rickman | Raytheon Co. | Chairperson |
| \* | Lindsey | Schurle | Spirit AeroSystems |  |
|  | Greg | Syvertson | Bell Helicopter Textron |  |
| \* | Fabrice | Trebeden | Airbus Helicopters |  |
|  | Zia | Usmani | BAE Systems (MAI) UK |  |
| \* | Barry | Ward | Rolls-Royce |  |
|  | Kara | Warrensford | Honeywell Aerospace |  |
| \* | Gary | Winters | Northrop Grumman Corporation |  |
| \* | Huiqing | Zhang | COMAC |  |

***Other Members/Participants Present (\* Indicates Voting Member)***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | NAME |  | COMPANY NAME |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Fernando | Alarcon De Lastra Halcon | Centro Analisis Agropecuario (Canagrosa) |  |
| \* | Pedro | Astola-Gonzalez | TITANIAA, Ensayos y Proyectos Industriales S.L. |  |
|  | Ramakrishnan | Balasubramanian | Tii Techno Testing Services Pvt. Ltd. |  |
|  | Lei | Bao | NCS Testing Technology Co., Ltd. |  |
| \* | Umberto | Baratta | Bytest SRL |  |
| \* | Corwyn | Berger | Exova, Inc. |  |
|  | Bruno | Billeci | Exova PTP |  |
|  | Lynda | Braine | ITS Testing Services (UK), Ltd. |  |
|  | Hugh F. | Casper | MTS Systems Corporation |  |
|  | Pedro | De la Lastra | Centro Analisis Agropecuario (Canagrosa) |  |
|  | Bill | Dhillon | Senior Aerospace – Thermal Engineering |  |
|  | Niall | Dodds | Exova PLC |  |
|  | Bardrillart | Eglanline | SYPAC |  |
|  | Timothy | Esau | Element Materials Technology |  |
|  | Dave | Eshleman | The Young Engineers |  |
|  | Phil | Evans | Senior Aerospace – Thermal Engineering |  |
| \* | Kay | Fisher | Bohler Edelstahl GmbH & Co KG |  |
|  | David | Fluck | Haynes International, Inc. |  |
| \* | Markus | Fuchsmann | Otto Fuchs KG |  |
|  | Brendan | Fullam | Sturbridge Metallurgical Services, Inc. |  |
| \* | Courtney | Grimes | Sturbridge Metallurgical Services, Inc. |  |
|  | Mirko | Grotto | RTM Breda |  |
|  | Luis | Guelbenzu | Applus Laboratories |  |
| \* | Robert | Haldane | Alcoa, Inc. |  |
|  | Chris | Harwood | Exova PLC |  |
|  | Christoph | Henkel | AMAG Rolling |  |
|  | Daniel | Hunt | Haynes International, Inc. |  |
|  | Ashfaq | Khan | Timet |  |
| \* | Rick | Kuhns | Bristol Indistries |  |
| \* | David | Luoni | Element Materials Technology |  |
| \* | Ralph | Mast | VDM Metals International |  |
|  | Marko | Matijas | Alcoa |  |
|  | Diana | Morera Valdera | TEAMS |  |
|  | Emmanuel | Muzangaza | The Manufacturing Technology Centre |  |
|  | Roger | Ng | Oerlikon Metco (Canada), Inc. |  |
| \* | Annette | O’Connell | Haynes International, Inc. |  |
|  | Owen | O’Grady | Exova |  |
| \* | Bob | Olevson | Element Materials Technology |  |
| \* | Andrea | Pierce | NSL Analytical Services, Inc. |  |
|  | Robin | Proudfoot | Ross & Catherall |  |
|  | Antonio | Ramirez | TEAMS |  |
| \* | Ben | Ransom | RTI Advanced Forming, Inc. |  |
|  | Ashwin | Rao | Special Metals Wiggin, Ltd. - IncoTest |  |
|  | Stan | Revers | Senior Aerospace – Thermal Engineering |  |
| \* | Jim | Rossi | Westmoreland Testing |  |
| \* | Paulina | Sandoval | Centro de Investigacion en Materiales Avanzados |  |
| \* | Peter | Scrimshire | Special Metals Wiggin, Ltd. - IncoTest |  |
| \* | David | Serbousek | Olympic Scientific, Inc. |  |
|  | Caroline | Sorel | SYPAC |  |
|  | Jason | Staples | ITS Testing Services (UK), Ltd. |  |
|  | Kumara | Subramanian Sethu | Tii Techno Testing Services Pvt. Ltd. |  |
|  | Francesc | Tort Santacana | Instron |  |
| \* | Simon | Tiurnebize | Aubert & Duval |  |
| \* | Donna | Warner | Heartland Precision Fasteners, Inc. |  |
|  | Samantha | Withers | Exova PLC |  |
|  | Helen | Young | Timet UK, Ltd. |  |

***PRI Staff Present***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Ethan | Akins |
| Robert | Hoeth |
| Kevin | Wetzel |

## Safety Information – CLOSED/OPEN

Emergency Exits and how to vacate the building were reviewed. Attendees were requested to notify PRI Staff of any emergencies.

## Review Code of Ethics and Meeting Conduct – CLOSED/OPEN

Code of Ethics, Antitrust, and meeting conduct were reviewed with the meeting rules and meeting voting protocol.

Subscriber Responsibilities to support the Task Group were presented.

## Present the Antitrust Video – CLOSED/OPEN

The Antitrust Video was presented.

## Review Agenda – CLOSED/OPEN

The agenda was reviewed and agreed upon without modification.

All presentations from the meeting are to be posted in [www.eAuditNet.com](http://www.eAuditNet.com) under Resources → Public Documents → Materials Testing Laboratories → Nadcap Meeting Presentations → June 2016.

# REVIEW DELEGATION STATUS – CLOSED

The Metrics tab on the eAuditNet Dashboard and the t-frm-07s for all reviewers were presented. All current delegated reviewers (Kevin Wetzel, Rob Hoeth, Jim Lewis, and Bob Lizewski) continue to meet the requirements defined in OP 1115. After review of all comments addressed in t‑frm‑07s, there were no issues that required additional actions. All delegated reviewers maintained their delegation status.

The t-frm-07 was presented and discussed for Justin Rausch, a non-delegated reviewer. There were no concerns raised with his progress. Justin has been reviewing audits since November, 2015.

Kevin Wetzel reported the plan for the contracting of Liz Bojan as a consultant audit report reviewer.

# MATTERS OF ACCREDITATION – CLOSED

The schedule developed for Subscriber audit report reviews was reviewed. Subscriber voting members are assigned by month the audits to be reviewed.

Appeal for failure of audit 162541was reviewed. The Supplier failed to submit the appeal within the required 10 days of notification of the ask Group decision. The appeal was denied as the NCRs were considered to be properly grouped, still exceeding the failure threshold, as well as the failure to submit the appeal in time.

Audit 163776 was the next audit after the Task Group’s review of potential allegations of wrongdoing at a Supplier. The Task Group had asked the Auditor to provide feedback regarding these allegations. No required actions were identified during the audit or Subscriber review of the feedback.

The Risk Mitigation process was reviewed. Risk Mitigation Team (RMT) delinquency is a concern. RMT assignments were updated, adding members where needed to facilitate the review.

The MOU between MTL and Heat Treating (HT) was discussed to add L5X micro-indentation hardness per ARP1820. This has been tabled due to Heat Treat not agreeing to the proposed change.

# AUDITOR CONSISTENCY (OP 1117) – CLOSED

## MTL Auditor Consistency Work Instructions

The work instructions were reviewed by the Task Group along with all comments provided after distribution to the Subscriber Voting Members. Changes based on the comments were made.

Motion made by Dan Graves and seconded by Amanda Rickman to approve the Work Instructions as edited. Motion Passed.

## Present Auditor Evaluations – Dashboard (Specific Auditor/Supplier Discussion)

The Metrics Dashboard in eAuditNet was presented. The average overall auditor performance score is 5.88 out of 6.0.

## Present Supplier Feedback

The Supplier Feedback process was reviewed as an introduction prior to reviewing specific negative feedback for audit 174660, where the Supplier answered that the Auditor was not consistent with previous Auditors. This was an initial MTL audit and the Supplier was comparing the Nadcap Auditor to their previous audits for ISO9001 and ISO17025. No action was required from this review.

## Subscriber Audit Observation Report

Observation reports were reviewed. No concerns needed to be addressed for these observations.

ACTION ITEM: Kevin Wetzel to send to the subscriber voting members a list of currently scheduled audits between 01Jul-16 and 01-Mar-17 to consider for audit observations. (Due Date: 30-Jun-2017)

## Data Review

The standard data set addressed in OP 1117 was reviewed. No action was required from this review.

# Auditor Conference – CLOSED

In the future, the Auditor Conference will be split between Europe and US every other year. MTL will not participate in Europe based on current capacity because there is only one European auditor.

A rough agenda for auditor conference was discussed and was to be reviewed in the open meeting for the purpose of the creation of sub-teams for presentations.

The Subscribers were asked if there was value in presentations to the Auditors showing where to find specific Subscriber requirements and how to audit to Subscriber requirements. It was decided that this would be beneficial.

See agenda item 10.0 for more details.

# VOTING MEMBER updates & COMPLIANCE WITH VOTING REQUIREMENTS – OPEN

## Confirm Any New Voting Member Applications

The following requests for additions or changes to voting membership were received and confirmed by the Task Group Chairperson pending verification of PD 1100 requirements:

* Subscriber Voting Member: UVM
* Supplier Voting Member: SVM
* Alternate: ALT
* Task Group Chairperson: CHR
* Vice Chairperson: VCH
* Secretary: SEC

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **First Name** | **Surname** | **Company** | **Position:**  **(new / updated role)** | **Meetings Attended (Month/Year)** | |
| Raul | Olmo Mora | Airbus | ALT UVM | Feb/2016 | Jun/2016 |
| Frank | Lennert | The Boeing Company | UVM to ALT UVM | N/A | N/A |
| John | Knie | The Boeing Company | ALT UVM to UVM | N/A | N/A |
| Markus | Fuchsmann | Otto Fuchs KG – Iron & Steel | ALT SVM | Jun/2013 | Jun/2014 |
| Paulina | Sandoval Valles | Centro de Investigacion en Materiales Avanzandos | SVM | Oct/2015 | Jun/2016 |
| Courtney | Grimes | Sturbridge Metallurgical Services | SVM | Jun/2015 | Jun/2016 |
| Ralph | Mast | VDM Metals International | SVM | Mar/2015 | Feb/2016 |
| Claudia | Granados Torres | Honeywell Aerospace | SEC Current UVM | N/A | N/A |

## Review Compliance with Voting Requirements of Present Voting Members

The compliance to voting requirements per PD 1100 were reviewed. All Voting Members have met requirements for maintaining their voting rights.

The Succession Plan was updated with Barry Ward of Rolls Royce to accept the position of Vice Chair when Dan Graves moves into the Chair Role.

# MTL Nadcap – Open

## MTL Tutorial

An MTL Task Group Tutorial was presented. No further discussion followed.

## SSC Presentation

A presentation concerning the Supplier Support Committee (SSC) and its function was provided by David Eshleman, in place of Sharon Norton, the MTL TG SSC representative.

# Activity Reports – Open

## Feedback from the Previous Meeting

Only three responses were submitted for the previous meeting feedback, in concern of meeting location and the meeting room used.

## Review Major Activity from Previous Meeting

There were no Checklist working groups. The only major activity was Risk Mitigation Team reviews.

## Review Status of Checklist Revisions

AC7101/1 G – Revision process started

AC7101/2 D – To be used on audits conducted on or after 22-Mar-2015

AC7101/3 D – NMC ballot ended 2-Jun-2016

AC7101/4 F – To be used on audits conducted on or after 14-Aug-2016

AC7101/5 D – To be used on audits conducted on or after 22-Mar-2015

AC7101/6 D – Revision process completed; ready for TG ballot

AC7101/7 D – To be used on audits starting on or after 15-May-2016

AC7101/9 C – TG affirmation ballot ended 17-Jun-2016

AC7101/11 C – To be used on audits conducted on or after 25-Oct-2015

## TAG Activity Summary

## TAG 1 – Kay Fisher reported on Proficiency Testing Program Selection Process A (Subscriber with preferred PT providers and prioritized list of method of compliance) or Process B (Subscribers with NO preference of PT Providers and Any PTP program is OK, so long as rules laid down in AC7101/1G (draft) Appendix E are followed.). The majority of the Subscribers chose Process B. The TAG also presented information concerning method of compliance using IRR, SPC, and Gage R&R this will be included in AC7101/1G (draft) Appendix D. Calibration frequencies were also discussed for Appendix F for AC7101/1 Rev G (draft) (Appendix E Rev F). The TAG will continue to review these frequencies to determine if all are traceable to a source requirement.

TAG 2 – No Activity but Dave Luoni requested the following be brought to the Task Group.

“In reviewing the top 10 findings for AC7101/2, I find that six of the ten are procedural in nature. In other words, the procedures do not contain adequate detail to address the checklist requirements, or a schedule has not been implemented, as required. I believe that this type of requirement warrants a discussion, in an effort to better educate and explain the steps necessary to demonstrate compliance procedurally.

The number one finding is the chemistry matrix. This has been the number one finding since the requirements were originally implemented in May 1993. I would like to request that we take a close look at this and do a ‘deep dive’ into the reasons for this requirement continuing to be the number one issue, at the June meeting. Twenty-three years is a long time for one requirement to be number one in findings. I would also request that we query the Primes as to the value of this information as part of the Nadcap audit.”

As a result of this request a breakout session was conducted. See agenda item 12.2 for additional details.

TAG 3 – No Activity

TAG 4 – No Activity

TAG 5 – No Activity

TAG 6 – No Activity

TAG 7 – Machining aluminum was updated in MTL Handbook as addressed below.

TAG 9 – No Activity

TAG 11 – No Activity

TAG Rosters were reviewed and updated

MTL Handbook Activity - Derek Sicotte reported the following updates:

Paragraph 5.7.1 was revised to include the availability of the AC7101/7 Rev D supplement spreadsheet and to identify that Low Stress Grinding and Polishing does not apply to preparation of Aluminum samples. (Pg. 10)

Test Codes were added to the table for /4. (Pg. 15)

AC7101/1 Rev. F and AC7101/2 Rev. D Handbook Supplements were published 03/29/16.

AC7101/7 Rev D Handbook Supplement were published 04/15/16.

## Ad-hoc Committees Reports

Audit Grading needs to be continued for AC7101/11 as it is a standalone document. Data for AC7101/11 will be collected for a year and reanalyzed.

ACTION ITEM: Kevin Wetzel to continue the process of gathering the audit grading report for one year for analysis for AC7101/11. (Due Date: 30-Jun-2017)

MTL Audit Review Expectations ad-hoc committee was closed with no action required.

# Audit Effectiveness – Open

The Audit Effectiveness Template was completed for report out at Planning and Ops.

# Auditor Conference – Open

A request for Suppliers and Subscribers that would like to present topic to the Auditors was made.

Fastener Bolt Testing is to be prepared by Donna Warner and Don Huffman.

Subscriber specific requirements are to be prepared by David Bale (Pratt & Whitney Canada) and John Knie (The Boeing Company).

Matrices overview for AC7101/2 for technical training and AC7101/1 for informational training is to be prepared by Dave Luoni and Kay Fisher.

Two topics are being added to the Auditor Conference as requested by the Audit Effectiveness Sub-Team. One is an open/group discussion to allow for peer review and sharing best practices. The second is to provide an update on industry standards used by the TG.

Checklist updates are to be prepared by the TAG chairs.

Auditor guidance for exact wording issues in checklists versus procedures, incorporating check list changes, etc., is to be prepared by Kay Fisher and Derek Sicotte for refresher training.

ISO vs ASTM tensile testing presentation is to be prepared by Christoph Henkel.

ACTION ITEM: Kevin Wetzel to send the list of the auditor conference topics to all voting members to accept the topics and raise any additional topics that need to be reviewed during the auditor conference. (Due Date: 31-Jul-2016)

# Task Group Issues – Open

Chemical Processing Task Group Members and Staff Engineer (Nick Magnapera, Zia Usmani, Hal Abel, and Ethan Akin) Spoke to MTL TG to seek clarification on ASTM B117. 7.2 requires specific gravity to determine salt concentration. The question is if titration with silver nitrate, refractive index, etc., can be used and converted to specific gravity,

Motion by Dave Serbousek to remove titration as an optional method of determining the sodium chloride concentration of the condensate. Guidance will be added to the AC7101/6 supplement; as the checklist requires to perform analysis according to the specification, the checklist does not require further modification. Seconded by Bob Olevson. Motion Passed.

ACTION ITEM: Derek Sicotte to coordinate Guidance to be added to the AC7101/6 supplement to remove titration as an optional method to determine salt concentration. (Due Date: 31-Jul-2016)

The frequency of Nadcap Meetings survey was discussed and completed. The Task Group is against going to only two Nadcap meeting per year

# Breakout Sessions – Open

## Checklist Revision Sub-Team

No checklist revision breakout sessions occurred at this meeting.

## TAG Sub-Teams

TAG /1, led by Kay Fisher, met and covered the review of IRR/PT changes.

TAG /2. led by Dave Luoni, met and covered the top NCRs and the chemical matrix.

ACTION ITEM: Kevin Wetzel to query the Auditors as to why procedural questions 9.4.5 and 9.4.6 are written up to try to identify inconsistencies and disconnects. (Due Date: 31-Jul-2016)

ACTION ITEM: Kevin Wetzel to query the Auditors as to the issues they are seeing with the chemical matrix to try to identify inconsistencies and disconnects with the completion of the matrix. (Due Date: 31-Jul-2016)

TAG /6 addressed the Salt Spray issue in agenda item 11.0

# Nadcap Meeting Reports – Open

## Supplier Support Committee

David Eshleman, in place of Sharon Norton, gave an overview of the SSC meeting. For more details, please review the SSC minutes posted on [www.p-r-i.org](http://www.p-r-i.org).

Concerns were discussed if NCRs will be raised on findings during the required self-audit that cannot be closed prior to the Nadcap audit.

## Planning and Ops

Amanda Rickman reported on the Planning & Ops meeting. For more details, please review the Planning and Ops minutes posted on [www.p-r-i.org](http://www.p-r-i.org).

# MTL Program Status – Open

## NMC Metrics

Kevin Wetzel presented a review of the health of the MTL Task Group via the Dashboard in eAuditNet. The NMC metrics were also reviewed by the Task Group. No action was required.

## Auditor Capacity

Kevin Wetzel presented a review of Auditor Capacity. US capacity is currently good but there is a need for additional capacity in Europe and Asia. MTL is always looking for additional Auditor candidates.

# Meeting Wrap Up – Open

## Affirm Ad-hoc Committees

No new Ad-Hoc committees were formed.

## Vote on Handbook Revisions – ‘Confirmed Handbook Content’

Handbook changes developed during the meeting were reported out by Derek Sicotte and confirmed.

## Review/Update RAIL

No Action Items were reported out at the close of the meeting.

## Determine Meeting Objectives for Next Meeting

The following objectives were set for the October 2016 meeting:

* AC7101/1 Breakout session
* AC7101/2 Breakout session
* Christian Schwaminger and Bob Haldane RAIL report out; ASTM E29 and ISO 80000-1 rounding topic
* AC7101/7 Breakout for Handbook supplement guidance
* The SSC preview report will not be on the October Agenda - Only the SSC Report will be allotted time
* AC7101/11 Breakout session

## Compose Agenda (Open/Closed dates and times) for Next Meeting

The agenda for the October 2016 meeting will follow the same format as the October 2015 meeting. The Auditor Conference will be on Sunday. A three (3) day meeting will be held Monday through Wednesday with the following breakdown:

* Monday-1/2 day closed
* Breakout Rooms requested: Tuesday (all day)
* Report outs after lunch following NMC at Large with one hour closed session at end of Wednesday

ADJOURNMENT – 23-Jun-2016 – Meeting was adjourned at 1:00 p.m.

Minutes Prepared by: Claudia Granados (claudialourdes.granados@honeywell.com)

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| \*\*\*\*\* For PRI Staff use only: \*\*\*\*\*\*  Are procedural/form changes required based on changes/actions approved during this meeting? (select one)  YES\*  NO  \*If yes, the following information is required: | | |
| Documents requiring revision: | Who is responsible: | Due date: |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |