**UNCONFIRMED MINUTES**

**FEBRUARY 22 – 23, 2017**

**NEW ORLEANS, LOUISIANA, USA**

**These minutes are not final until confirmed by the Task Group in writing or by vote at a subsequent meeting. Information herein does not constitute a communication or recommendation from the Task Group and shall not be considered as such by any agency.**

**WEDNESDAY, 22-FEB-2017 to THURSDAY, 23-FEB-2017**

# OPENING COMMENTS

## Call to Order / Quorum Check

The Sealant (SLT) Task Group was called to order at 8:00 a.m., 22-Feb-2017.

Quorum was in place Wednesday 22-Feb-2017 from 9:30 a.m. to 4:30 p.m. and covered agenda items 1.6, 5.0 through 11.0, and 21.0. The rest of the agenda items were covered without quorum and no decisions were made.

It was verified that only SUBSCRIBER MEMBERS were in attendance during the closed portion of the meeting.

A quorum was established with the following representatives in attendance:

***Subscriber Members/Participants Present (\* Indicates Voting Member)***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | NAME |  | COMPANY NAME |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| \* | Kent | DeFranco | Lockheed Martin Corp. | Chairperson, proxy for R. Bove and D. Nickerson |
|  | Aaron | Duncan | Honeywell Aerospace |  |
| \* | Alan | Fletcher | US Air Force |  |
| \* | Mitch | Gourley | Textron Aviation |  |
| \* | Manuel | Koucouthakis | Honeywell Aerospace |  |
|  | Roger | Merriman | Textron Aviation |  |
| \* | Norberto | Roiz-Lafuente | Airbus Defence & Space |  |

***Other Members/Participants Present (\* Indicates Voting Member)***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | NAME |  | COMPANY NAME |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| \* | Jim | Carney | NSL Aerospace | Proxy for R. Wilt |
| \* | Suzanna | DeMoss | 3M Company Aerospace and Aircraft Maintenance Department |  |
| \* | Bruce | Gormley | Cytec Solvay Groupt |  |
| \* | Ronald | Hendriks | Chemetall GmbH |  |
| \* | David | Jordan | Chemetall GmbH |  |
| \* | Joshua | Mazin | Flamemaster Corp. |  |
|  | Craig | Riffel | PPG Aerospace |  |
| \* | Jeff | Steele | Cytec Solvay Group | Proxy for P. Shackley |

***PRI Staff Present***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Linda | Beene |

## Safety Information – OPEN

Fire exits in the meeting room were reviewed. Attendees were also requested to inform PRI Staff of any emergencies.

## Review of Code of Ethics and Meeting Conduct – OPEN

The code of ethics was reviewed and explained to the SLT TG members; no questions were raised.

## Present the Antitrust Video – OPEN

The Antitrust Video was viewed with the SLT TG members; no questions were raised.

## Review Agenda – OPEN

The agenda for the February 2017 meeting was reviewed. Attendees were given the opportunity to discuss their expectations for this meeting. No expectations beyond what was listed in the agenda were expressed. SLT Audit Handbook Agenda Item will not be discussed. All items requiring a vote were moved to Wednesday.

## Acceptance of Meeting Minutes– OPEN

Motion made by M. Koucouthakis and seconded by Jeff Steele to approve the October 2016 meeting minutes as written. Motion Passed.

The minutes from October 2016 were approved as written.

# Review Membership Status – OPEN

## Review/Confirm New Voting Members

The following requests for additions or changes to voting membership were received and confirmed by the Task Group Chairperson pending verification of PD 1100 requirements:

* Subscriber Voting Member: UVM
* Supplier Voting Member: SVM
* Alternate: ALT
* Task Group Chairperson: CHR
* Vice Chairperson: VCH
* Secretary: SEC

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **First Name** | **Surname** | **Company** | **Position:**  **(new / updated role)** | **Meetings Attended**  **(Month/Year)** | |
| Joshua | Mazin | Flamemaster Corp. | SVM  (updated) | Feb-2013 | Feb-2017 |
| David | Jordan | Chemetall GmbH | ALT SVM  (new) | Oct-2016 | Feb-2017 |
| Mitch | Gourley | Textron Aviation | UVM  (new) | Oct-2016 | Feb-2017 |
| Bruce | Gormley | Cytec Solvay Group | SVM  (new) | Oct-2016 | Feb-2017 |
| Craig | Riffel | PPG Aerospace | ALT SVM  (new) | Oct-2016 | Feb-2017 |
| Jeff | Steele | Cytec Solvay Group | Removed – Replaced by B. Gormley |  |  |

## Review Voting Membership Meeting Attendance and Voting Participation

The compliance to voting requirements per PD 1100 were reviewed. Gulfstream Aerospace (balloting), Honeywell Aerospace (balloting), NAVAIR (balloting), Pratt & Whitney (balloting), US Air Force (balloting), and UTC Aerospace (Goodrich) (balloting) have not met requirements for maintaining their voting rights. Voting rights will be maintained per the SLT Task Group Chairperson. An e-mail will be sent reminding Voting Members that have not met the voting requirements of the importance of voting to maintain their voting membership status.

ACTION ITEM: Task Group Chairperson to contact the voting members not in compliance with voting membership requirements to remind them to vote to maintain their status. (Due Date: 30-May-2017).

# SeaLanT task group rail – OPEN

The Rolling Action Item List (RAIL) was reviewed and updated.

For specific details, please see the current SLT Rolling Action Item List posted at [www.eAuditNet.com](http://www.eAuditNet.com), under Public Documents.

# Staff report - open

L. Beene presented the PRI Staff Report that included Auditor Status, SLT TG Metrics, Most Common NCRs, Non-Sustaining NCRs, Latest Changes, Future Nadcap Meeting Dates and Locations, Staff Delegation Metrics, Average Number of Major and Minor NCRs, and Audit Cycle Time.



## Auditor Status

The SLT TG currently has six auditors, and one auditor trainee.

## Task Group Metrics

The SLT TG metrics of Average Audit Cycle Time, Most Common NCRs, Average Number of Major and Minor NCRs, Delegation Metrics, and Non-Sustaining Corrective Actions were reviewed.

SLT TG requested that Auditor Capacity be separated by region.

ACTION ITEM: PRI Staff to see if it is possible separate Auditor Capacity metric into region. (Due Date: 30-May-2017).

## Most Common NCRs

The NCRs written against AC7200/1 and AC7202 were reviewed. The most common NCRs were: 1) Calibration issues; 2) Internal Procedures and Work Instructions; 3) Standard Test Conditions Temperature and Humidity Compliance; 4) Personnel and Training Documentation issues. The SLT TG recommended that more specific slides be presented on most common NCRs; it was also noted that top NCR paragraphs do not match the most common NCR’s identified.

## Non-Sustaining NCRs

In the last 12 months 3 Non-Sustaining NCR’s were issued.

## Latest Changes

The latest changes in eAuditNet were reviewed. Of particular interest were the Self-Audit Upload function and Risk Mitigation changes.

## Future Nadcap Meeting Dates and Locations

The future Nadcap meeting schedule is as follows: 5-8 June 2017 Berlin Germany, 24-28 October 2017 Pittsburgh Pennsylvania, 19-22 February 2018 Madrid Spain.

The SLT TG was asked about possible attendance for an Asia February 2020 Meeting. The Chairperson was the only task group member committing to possible attendance.

## Staff Engineer Delegation

Staff Engineer Delegation metrics of K. Purnell and J. Lewis were reviewed.

# SSC Report – open

S. DeMoss presented the Supplier Support Committee (SSC) update that included an overview of the SSC Leadership Team, how the SSC helps suppliers, current SSC activities, and their new Supplier Initiatives. For additional information please review the SSC minutes posted on the PRI website at [www.p-r-i.org](http://www.p-r-i.org).

R. Hendricks volunteered to be the SSC Representative for the SLT TG.

Motion made by S. DeMoss and seconded by A. Fletcher to approve R. Hendricks as SSC Representative for SLT TG. Motion Passed.

# review of procedure changes – open

## Review any changes to General Operating Procedures since the last meeting

K. DeFranco presented the summary of changes to General Operating Procedures PD 1100, OP 1102, OP 1105, OP 1106, OP 1112, OP 1116, OP1118, OP 1123, and OP 1124 since the October 2016 meeting. It was recommended, during the review of OP1118 Changes, that there should be a metric that shows the number of NCR’s written during Observed audits versus Non-Observed audits.

## Review changes to OP 1114 and OP 1116 Appendices since the last meeting

There were no changes to OP 1114 Appendix SLT or OP 1116 Appendix SLT since the October 2016 meeting.

# status of Aero Structure assembly task group – open

An update on the activities of Aero Structure Assembly Task Group was presented by K. DeFranco.



# sealant surveillance – open

SLT Surveillance Auditors identified 175 issues during surveillance in 2016. These are divided into eighteen (18) different categories. A brief summary of the issues identified during Sealant Surveillance from 1-Jan-2016 to 31-Dec-2016 was presented**:**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **ERROR CODES:** | Occurrences |
| A) simple typo such as spelling, punctuation, decimal point, or transposition | 5 |
| B) test result omitted | 1 |
| C) wrong test result value reported | 50 |
| D) calculation error | 0 |
| E) wrong time, temperature, relative humidity, or fluid used | 0 |
| F) wrong test procedure used | 0 |
| G) wrong batch / lot numbers | 2 |
| H) test equipment out of tolerance | 0 |
| I) spec procedure not followed | 1 |
| J) test report without correct date or signature missing | 18 |
| K) wrong test specimen prep (size, shape, thickness or substrate) | 0 |
| L) calibration dates past due, stickers missing or certificates in error | 0 |
| M) test specimen(s) missing | 21 |
| N) QA policy or procedure not followed | 0 |
| O) Failing test result | 8 |
| P) Missing test document(s) | 9 |
| Q) Wrong test requirement on TR or Lab Test Sheet | 34 |
| R) Missing information on TR, Lab Test Sheet, or test document | 22 |
| S) Wrong test report offered | 3 |

Suppliers should continue tracking this information internally and working to reduce these issues. While some of these do not have product impact at the time, there is still the potential from some of them. The consensus was that the categories showing high error numbers should be broken down further; this will be evaluated.. Another suggestion was that the numbers be reported quarterly so improvement could be more easily assessed. Information should be updated at least one month prior to each Nadcap meeting. Suppliers also requested a copy of their discrepancies be forwarded to their SLT TG Attendee.

A Sub-Team of S. DeMoss, A. Fletcher, D. Jordan, and K. DeFranco was established to consider the possibility of supplier merit for surveillance.

ACTION ITEM: K. Purnell to update the SLT Surveillance issues report with the latest available information prior to each Nadcap Meeting and provide quarterly breakdown of information. (Due Date: 1-Jun-2017)

ACTION ITEM: K. Purnell to provide a onetime summary of SLT Surveillance discrepancies specific to each supplier to their Task Group representative. (Due Date: 30-Apr-2017)

# op 1117 auditor consistency – open

The SLT TG reviewed its Auditor Consistency progress and Auditor Consistency Tracking Spreadsheet. All actions were up to date.

# Audit Failure Criteria – open

Audit failure criteria from 1 year, 2016, 2 years, 2015 and 2016 combined, 3 years, 2014, 2015, and 2016 combined, and 4 years, 2013 to 2016, were reviewed. The reason for reviewing multiple years of data is the limited number of audits performed by the SLT TG. OP 1110 paragraph 4.1.2.1.5 states “New Task Groups are requested to define their failure criteria (Mode B) once a statistically valid number of audits (e.g. 32 audits) have been conducted or at the second anniversary of their checklist publication”. It required 3 years of SLT audit data to exceed 32 audits.

SLT TG reviewed the above failure data. Since both checklists have just been revised it was decided to keep the existing audit failure criteria.

Motion made by A. Fletcher and seconded by M. Koucouthakis to maintain the current Failure Criteria for 2017. Motion Passed.

ACTION ITEM: K. Purnell to forward SLT TG 2017 failure criteria to M. Graham. (Due Date: 8-Mar-2017)

# ac7202 and ac 7200/1 – open

Ballot comments for AC7202 and AC7200/1 Rev D were reviewed and resolved or withdrawn with the intent to be incorporated in the next revision. A format was presented and adopted by the SLT TG, to display a running list of actions to be incorporated in the next revision of the document and placed in the SLT Task Group Work Area - Forum for Task Group visibility on eAuditNet.

ACTION ITEM: PRI Staff to send SLT TG Members training on how to find and use the Task Group Forum. (Due Date: 30-May-2017)

# sealant audit handbook review – open

This item was not discussed.

# Audit effectiveness – open

The SEAL TG Audit Effectiveness spreadsheet was reviewed. No further action is needed at this time.

# 2017 Auditor Conference – open

The proposed topics for the 2017 auditor conference were reviewed as listed below:

* Most Common NCRs and NCR Data Analysis for Auditor Consistency
* Checklists AC7200/1, AC7202, & AC7129
* Review of revised checklists
* Review of Revised SLT Audit Handbook
* Selection of Job Audits – Job Tracker
* Paper/Demo/Virtual/Coupon Job Audit
* Level of Specification Review
* Verification of Customer Flow down Requirements
* Sealant Surveillance
* PRI Sealant QPG & G9 Update
* Auditor Conduct
* Question and Answer Session

The following topics were also suggested and will be added:

* Self-Audit, including Auditee requirements
* Calibration/verification requirements to AC7200/1 Paragraph 12.4

# The SLT TG also requested feedback from auditors on how they use the pre-audit information.

ACTION ITEM: K. Purnell to obtain feedback from auditors on how they use the pre-audit information. (Due Date: 1-Jun-2017)

# SUPPLIER INPUT on auditor selection – open

The SLT TG discussed the potential for Supplier input in the Auditor Selection Process (e.g. participating in interviews). It was agreed that Suppliers would like to be involved, but the decision on the extent has not been determined. OP 1116 allows TG voting members to participate in auditor interviews.

# SeaLant Task Group Initiatives – open

The SLT TG created the following list of activities and rated them as High (H), Medium (M) or Low (L) priority and if are (A) Active, (N) Not Active or (C) Closed. The list was created so the SLT TG maintains focus on its high priority tasks.

(H-A) Tracking future changes to AC7200/1 and AC7202 in spreadsheet

(H-A) OP 1117 auditor consistency progress tracking

(H-A) October 2017 Auditor Conference

(H-C) Audit Effectiveness, job tracker

(H-C) Sealant Audit Handbook Revision for Testing

(H-C) Compliance with NMC Checklist Vision – SLT Application Checklist AC7129

(H-C) Develop Auditor training requirements for SLT Application Auditors

(H-C) OP 1114 Appendix SLT revision to address addition of AC7129 and SLT Audit Handbook to references in 5.0

(H-C) Subscriber Specification Sealant Testing Requirements

(H-C) Sealant Application Checklist – Scope is verifying the sealing activities are being performed correctly, number of suppliers to be audited, training program, certification program, Subscriber willingness to mandate; sub-team working on subscribers that responded to survey; following Sealant Application Move Forward Plan.

(M-C) Auditor Consistency Oversight (Subscriber / Supplier Feedback) OP 1117 minimum once a year.

(L-C) Contract Sealant Application Auditors

(L-C) Sealant Applicator / Technician Qualification Program (eQuaLearn)

(L-C) Sealant Test Laboratory Independent Audit Question Development AC7200/1 & AC7202

# new business – open

No new business was discussed.

# Meeting Close out – open

## Review of Action Items Assigned During the Meeting

Action items identified during the meeting were reviewed and due dates established. For specific details, please see the current SLT Rolling Action Item List posted at [www.eAuditNet.com](http://www.eAuditNet.com), under Public Documents.

## Set Next Meeting Agenda Topics

June 2017 Agenda Topics were determined. Open agenda topics will include:

* Voting Member Updates and Compliance with Voting Requirements
* SLT RAIL Review
* Staff Report
* SSC Report
* Status of Aero Structure Assembly Task Group
* Audit Effectiveness
* OP 1117 Auditor Consistency
* Review of Procedure Changes since the February 2017 meeting
* AC7202 and AC7200/1
  + Ballot Comment Resolution / Revisions
  + Future Changes
* Sealant Audit Handbook Review
* Sealant Surveillance
* Sealant Initiatives
* Supplier Input on Auditor Selection
* New Business
* Meeting Close Out

# Auditors – closed

## Data Analysis Review – Overall Auditor Performance

Auditor performance was reviewed and included the Average and Total NCRs per Day written by the Auditors, Staff Engineer feedback, and Supplier feedback. This information is used for evaluating Auditor Consistency. The 2017 Observation plan was reviewed. One new Auditor will need to be observed.

## OP 1117 Auditor Consistency

OP 1117 Auditor Consistency Tracking spreadsheet was reviewed. All actions were up to date.

# Audits – closed

## Review Scheduled and Conducted Audits

Scheduled and conducted audits were reviewed.

The current SLT audit schedule for the next six months was reviewed; one observations audit is scheduled for 2017.

Sealant audits in Staff Engineer Review were reviewed; no specific actions were identified or required.

ACTION ITEM: Subscribers that can observe a SLT audit are to notify PRI Staff or sign up in eAuditNet. (Due Date: 30-Apr-2017)

## Discuss Problem Audits

No problem audits were discussed.

## Audit Gaming

One reason for Job tracker is to assure different jobs and operators are observed in subsequent audits.

# review delegation status – closed

Staff Engineer, K. Purnell met the minimum criteria of having at least 10% of findings reviewed by the Task Group Subscribers with at least a 90% concurrence rate. The requirement to review at least ten audits was not met, however, the Task Group agreed to waive that requirement. K. Purnell maintains delegated status.

Staff Engineer, J. Lewis did not meet the minimum met the minimum criteria of having at least 10% of findings reviewed by the Task Group Subscribers with at least a 90% concurrence rate as there were no findings on the audit reviewed in this period. As delegation was only recently granted, the review of a minimum of 10 audits was not met either. The Task Group agreed to waive these criteria. J. Lewis maintains delegated status.

Motion made by M. Koucouthakis and seconded by M. Gourley to waive the TG Subscriber concurrence rate and number of annual audits criteria for J. Lewis and K. Purnell, and to maintain delegation. Motion Passed.

# sealant surveillance – closed

## Review Charts

The Sealant Surveillance Program was reviewed. Inspectors are recording discrepancies identified during surveillance. The importance of verifying Manufacturing Work Instructions was discussed. The Sealant Surveillance spreadsheets with the issues identified in 2016 were reviewed.

## Open Discussion

No new topics were discussed.

## Potential Supplier Merit Program for Sealant Surveillance

A discussion was held regarding the possibility of allowing surveillance less frequently for good results without issues, similar to the merit program for audits.

# closed meeting issues – closed

The SLT TG needs a Secretary and a Vice Chairperson. No one at the meeting volunteered for these positions.

ACTION ITEM: Subscriber Voting Members interested in being the SLT TG Secretary or Vice Chairperson should e-mail PRI Staff. (Due Date: 31-May-2017)

# meeting close out – closed

## Review of Action Items Assigned During the Meeting

Action items identified during the meeting were reviewed and due dates established. For specific details, please see the current SLT Rolling Action Item List posted at [www.eAuditNet.com](http://www.eAuditNet.com), under Public Documents.

## Set Next Meeting Agenda Topics

Agenda Topics for June 2017 Nadcap Meeting in in Berlin Germany were determined.

Closed agenda topics will include:

* Auditors – Data Analysis Review and Auditor Consistency
* Audits
* Review Delegation Status
* Sealant Surveillance
  + Possibly Supplier Merit Program for Sealant Surveillance (extra hour to closed meeting)
* New Business
* Closed Meeting Issues

ADJOURNMENT – 23-Feb-2016 – Meeting was adjourned at 3:00 p.m.

Minutes Prepared by: Linda Beene; [linda.beene@sbcglobal.net](mailto:linda.beene@sbcglobal.net), Keith Purnell; [kpurnell@p-r-i.org](mailto:kpurnell@p-r-i.org)

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| \*\*\*\*\* For PRI Staff use only: \*\*\*\*\*\*  Are procedural/form changes required based on changes/actions approved during this meeting? (select one)  YES\*  NO  \*If yes, the following information is required: | | |
| Documents requiring revision: | Who is responsible: | Due date: |
| AC7202 | Keith Purnell | 30-Apr-2017 |
| AC7200/1 | Keith Purnell | 30-Apr-2017 |