**CONFIRMED MINUTES**

**OCTOBER 24-27, 2016**

**PITTSBURGH, PENNSYLVANIA, USA**

**These minutes are not final until confirmed by the Task Group in writing or by vote at a subsequent meeting. Information herein does not constitute a communication or recommendation from the Task Group and shall not be considered as such by any agency.**

**MONDAY, 24-OCT-2016 to WEDNESDAY, 27-OCT-2016**

# OPENING COMMENTS

## Call to Order / Quorum Check

The Metallic Materials Manufacturing (MMM) Task Group (TG) was called to order at 08:00 a.m., 24-Oct-2016.

It was verified that only SUBSCRIBER MEMBERS were in attendance during the closed portion of the meeting.

A quorum was established with the following representatives in attendance:

***Subscriber Members/Participants Present (\* Indicates Voting Member)***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | NAME |  | COMPANY NAME |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| \* | Thomas | Ancich | Rolls-Royce |  |
| \* | Mark | Antonellis | BAE Systems |  |
| \* | Elaine | Boswell | Rolls-Royce | Chairperson |
|  | David | Chang | Rolls-Royce |  |
|  | Craig | Clasper | Spirit Aerosystems |  |
|  | Chris | Davison | Spirit Aerosystems |  |
|  | Bob | Dawson | Honeywell Aerospace |  |
| \* | Greg | Goldhagen | UTC Aerospace (Hamilton Sundstrand) | Secretary |
|  | Jean Francois | Dumont | Airbus |  |
| \* | Raphael | Mentasti | SAFRAN Group |  |
|  | Jose A. | Moreno | Airbus Defence and Space |  |
|  | Thomas | Stevick | UTC Aerospace (Goodrich) |  |
| \* | Brian | Streich | Honeywell Aerospace | Vice Chairperson |
| \* | Johan | Tholerus | GKN Aerospace Sweden |  |

***Other Members/Participants Present (\* Indicates Voting Member)***

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | NAME |  | COMPANY NAME |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Josie | Bautista | Weber Metals Inc. |  |
|  | Thomas | Betz | PCC Airfoils, LLC. |  |
| \* | Ramachandra | Canumalla | Universal Stainless |  |
|  | Charles | Cho | Alcoa, Inc. |  |
|  | Joan | Curfman | FN America LLC |  |
| \* | Hugo | Guajardo | FRISA FORJADOS |  |
| \* | Bruce | Leckey | ATI Specialty Materials – Monroe Operations |  |
| \* | Beth  | Lewis | Wyman-Gordon Company |  |
|  | Giuseppe | Marzano | Magellan Aerospace, Haley |  |
| \* | Brian | Reynolds | Alcoa, Inc. |  |
| \* | William  | Rogers | Alcoa, Inc. |  |
| \* | Michael | Snyder | Special Metals Corp. |  |
|  | Mark | Timko | Weber Metals Inc. |  |
|  | Matt | Zanolli | Howmet Castings & Services, Inc. Arconic Power & Propulsion Howmet Dover Casting |  |

***PRI Staff Present***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Jerry | Aston |

## Safety Information

Safety was discussed and the exits were pointed out to the meeting attendees.

## Review Code of Ethics (Ref: Attendees’ Guide) and Meeting Conduct

The code of ethics was discussed and there were no comments.

## Review Antitrust Video – OPEN

The antitrust video was watched and there were no comments.

## Review Agenda

## Acceptance of Previous Meeting Minutes– OPEN

Motion made by Brian Streich and seconded by Greg Goldhagen to approve the June 2016 minutes as written. Motion Passed.

MMM Chairperson, Elaine Boswell gave ‘History of MMM task group’ presentation.

# rolling action item list (RAIL) Review – open

The Rolling Action Item List (RAIL) was reviewed.

For specific details, please see the current MMM Task Group Rolling Action Item List posted at [www.eAuditNet.com](http://www.eAuditNet.com), under Public Documents.

# VOTING MEMBER updates & COMPLIANCE WITH VOTING REQUIREMENTS

* Action Item Elaine Boswell to review status of voting members not currently meeting attendance requirements (Due February 2017 Meeting) Membership was reviewed per the requirements of PD1100.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **First Name** | **Surname** | **Company** | **Position:****(new / updated role)** | **Meetings Attended(Month/Year)** |
| Mark | Antonellis | BAE Systems | Voting Member | 6/2016 | 10/2016 |

# auditor consistency – open

Reviewed procedure OP 1117 – Auditor Consistency, and agreed on the actions the task group needs to take to be compliant with this procedure. It was agreed that only Forging audits would be considered at this time as it is too early to include Castings as checklist development has just started.

MMM TG does not see the need to have auditor proficiency assessments at this time but is open to creating proficiency assessments in the future.

The MMM TG identified the specific auditor qualification and experience requirements in OP 1116 Appendix MMM. It was also agreed that training modules covering the following are needed; Training for checklists, Audit Handbook, and Auditor Advisories.

ACTION ITEM: Brian Streich to create training module for training for checklists, MMM Audit Handbook, and Auditor Advisories. (Due Date: 01-Feb-2017).

It was discussed and agreed that there is a need to include a list of MMM TG Subscriber Member e-mail addresses on eAuditNet to enable auditors to contact them if they have any questions regarding the subscriber’s company specifications.

ACTION ITEM: Jerry Aston to e-mail Subscribers asking for permission to provide listing of subscriber e-mail addresses to auditors which may be posted on eAuditNet. (Due Date: 01-Dec-2016).

No additional specific MMM TG questions were needed for auditor observer feedback form at this time.

The standard data will be presented at each meeting and will include: NCRs per audit, NCRs per audit day, and observer feedback once that data is available.

It was agreed that the following data set would be presented annually: NCR per checklist paragraph, Supplier Feedback, and Auditor Evaluation.

A spreadsheet will be created for auditor observation schedule. New auditors will be observed as soon as possible after 3 audits but within 6 months. For existing auditors, the data will be reviewed in October 2017 to identify auditors of concern that will need to be observed in 2018. All auditors are to be observed at least every 2 years.

# Checklist development – open

Subscriber members were reminded that if they wish to have a checklist with subscriber specific questions a supplemental checklist (AC7140/S) then they need to supply question to Jerry Aston.

Rolls-Royce and Honeywell expressed interest and will supply questions for a supplemental checklist.

ACTION ITEM: Brain Streich and Elaine Boswell to develop questions for Supplemental Audit Criteria for Forgings. (Due Date: 01-Feb-2017).

It has been identified that in checklist AC7140 the question relating to dynamic recovery should be moved so as not to get missed during audits (when required). This is because section 7.1.2 becomes NA if the forging furnaces are controlled to AMS2750.

ACTION ITEM: Jerry Aston to make editorial changes. Move dynamic recovery question to better position out of 7.1.2. (Due Date: 01-Feb-2017).

Checklist AC7140 needs to be modified to include the requirement for suppliers to provide completed self-audit checklist 30 days before audit to the auditor. This is a Nadcap Management Council (NMC) requirement and the AC7140 will be balloted to the task group for this change.

ACTION ITEM: MMM to identify where to add to AC7140 requirement for supplier to provide completed self-audit checklist 30 days before audit. (Due Date: 01-Feb-2017).

# supplier support committee (ssc) report Out – open

SSC presentation was given by Jonathan Gonzalez SSC Representative. The presentation included what the SSC is and what SSC projects are ongoing. The presentation can be located on [www.p-r-i.org](http://www.p-r-i.org).

# Auditor conference – open

A debrief was given regarding the presentations given at the 2016 Auditor Conference held on the Saturday, 22-Oct-2016 and Sunday, 23-Oct-2016. It was noted that all presentations will be posted in eAuditNet > Resources > Documents > Public Documents > Metallic Materials Manufacturing > Training Documents.

ACTION ITEM: Jerry Aston to add subscriber presentations to eAuditNet. (Due Date: 15-Nov-2016)

A sub-team will be created for the October 2017 Auditor Conference. The agenda will start to be reviewed at the February 2017 Task Group Meeting.

Ideas for October 2017 Auditor Conference include; update of MMM Audit Handbook, Subscriber presentations, Checklist feedback from auditors, and improvements.

ACTION ITEM: MMM to set up sub-team and formalize agenda at Feb 2017 meeting. (Due Date: 28-Feb-2017).

# AC7140 audit handbook and Definitions – open

The definitions section in the AC7140 Audit handbook was reviewed and revised to include changes and clarifications. The AC740 Audit Handbook is posted eAuditNet > Resources > Documents > Public Documents > Metallic Materials Manufacturing > Handbooks & Guides.

# opening comments – closed

It was verified that only Subscriber Members were in attendance during the closed portion of the meeting and quorum was established.

# delegation – closed

No audits completed for review.

# auditor performance / feedback – closed

As of the October 2016 MMM TG Meeting no Nadcap Forging audits have been completed.

Roll-Royce informed that they are utilizing AC7140 to have Forging audits. These will be carried out by the same auditors as to be used by Nadcap for Forging audits. A request was made to allow auditors performing these Rolls-Royce Forging audits to be used to complete their Nadcap Forging audit training audits and be approved as auditors for Nadcap Forging. The Rolls-Royce audits will have a Rolls-Royce Task Group Member or Rolls-Royce Forging expert at these audits. It was agreed that these audits would be used for the Forging Auditors to become approved.

The MMM TG approves of Rolls-Royce’s plan to have a non-task group member representing Rolls-Royce at the Forging audit.

Motion made by Brian Streich and seconded by Greg Goldhagen to accept Rolls-Royce’s plan to have non-task group members representing Rolls-Royce at Forgings audits and for these audits to be used as training audits towards becoming an approved Nadcap Forgings Auditor. Motion Passed.

# audit results – closed

No audit results to review at this time.

# opening comments – open

It was verified that quorum was established.

# Subscriber mandates – open

A review of subscriber mandates was carried out. As of October 2016 the following was given:

Honeywell-Working out details, planning to mandate by mid-year 2017

Safran, still planning mandate with 2-3 year time frame, letter to be issued by next task group meeting.

GKN no mandate timescale but internal discussions are ongoing.

Hamilton Sundstrand no mandate timescale but internal discussions are ongoing.

Airbus no mandate timescale but internal discussions are ongoing.

Rolls-Royce has implemented the Rolls-Royce Forging program and plan to migrate to Nadcap in 2-3 years time. At this time, they will also accept Nadcap Forging audits in place of Rolls-Royce Forging audits.

# planned audits – open

No planned audits at this time.

# auditor recruitment – open

There are currently two United States based auditors and one Europe (Belgium) based auditor in training at this time.

# definitions – open

Definitions were reviewed during AC740 Audit Handbook agenda item.

# tabled subjects and other bussiness – open

No tabled subjects to review.

# agenda for february 2017 meeting – open

The structure of the next meeting to include Forgings and Castings to be as follows:

Monday, 20-Feb-2017: Forgings 8:00-9:00am closed - Open rest of day.

Tuesday, 21-Feb-2017: Forgings morning/Castings afternoon

Wednesday, 22-Feb-2017: Castings

Thursday, 23-Feb-2017: Castings

# new business– open

Succession planning was discussed and Brian Streich was willing to take over as Chairperson when the current chairperson steps down.

Brian Streich, Vice Chairperson, debriefed the task group that he is working with SAE to create a Forgings Specification and is basing this on the AC7140 checklist.

To improve the interview process of potential Forging Auditor’s a-frm-04 will be updated to include auditor knowledge/experience with alloys and equipment type in auditor experience section

ACTION ITEM: Jerry Aston to ballot auditor knowledge/experience update a-frm-04 MMM with alloys and equipment type in auditor experience section. (Due Date: 01-Feb-2017).

# rolling action item list (RAIL) Review – open

The Rolling Action Item List (RAIL) was reviewed.

For specific details, please see the current MMM Task Group Rolling Action Item List posted at [www.eAuditNet.com](http://www.eAuditNet.com), under Public Documents.

# opening comments – Casting – open

It was verified that quorum was established.

# Structure of casting task group – open

There was discussion if there should be a separate Chairperson and Vice Chairperson for Castings. It was agreed that Elaine Boswell would stay as MMM Chairperson but that a different Vice Chairperson should be established for Castings to run the Casting Checklist development would be the best way forward. It was agreed that Subscribers are to submit nominations for the Casting Vice Chairperson position before the February 2017 MMM Task Group meeting.

ACTION ITEM: Subscribers to submit potential nominations for Castings Vice Chairperson. (Due Date: 01-Feb-2017).

At the request of the suppliers the subscribers were asked for their mandate position as the suppliers do not wish to commit to supporting the Castings group if the Subscriber will not mandate.

Subscriber response below:

Rolls-Royce are committed to mandate

Hamilton Sundstrand have a stronger interest in Casting than for Forgings

Airbus will decide by the end of the year what their commitment will be.

GKN will wait to see the before making a decision on mandating.

BAE Systems have a very strong interest in castings.

Safran no position at moment

Honeywell have a strong interest in Castings and anticipating mandating

To improve attendance of the task group meetings the Subscribers were requested to contact casting foundries to support the meeting to aid checklist development.

ACTION ITEM: Subscribers to communicate with foundries that checklist is being developed. (Due Date: 01-Feb-2017).

To improve attendance of the task group meetings by Subscribers the NMC are to be contacted for support.

ACTION ITEM: Jerry Aston to contact NMC members about encouraging subscriber participation (Due Date: 01-Dec-2016).

The Subscribers were requested to provide a list of their Casting Suppliers.

ACTION ITEM: Subscribers to provide list of their Casting Suppliers. (Due Date: 20-Feb-2017).

The task group members were requested to review Subscriber forging specifications and industry specifications and highlight areas that should be considered for inclusion in the casting checklist. These requirements should be sent to Jerry Aston PRI before the February task group meeting.

ACTION ITEM: Task group to review Casting specifications and supply details to Staff Engineer for inclusion in the Casting checklist. (Due Date: 01-Feb-2017).

During the task group meeting the task group worked on producing a ‘Flow down’ covering Investment casting and Sand casting. These flow down will be used when the task group starts to create the Casting checklist. It was agreed that a working copy of this document would be added to the MMM task group Work Area.

ACTION ITEM: Jerry Aston to add the Casting Flow down document into Task Group Work Area on eAuditNet. (Due Date: 15-Nov-2016).

 Motion made by Brian Streich and seconded by Michael Snyder to adjourn. Motion Passed.

ADJOURNMENT – 27-Oct-2016 – Meeting was adjourned at 12:00 p.m.

Minutes Prepared by: Greg Goldhagen, gregory.goldhagen@hs.utc.com and Jerry Aston, jaston@p-r-i.org.

|  |
| --- |
| \*\*\*\*\* For PRI Staff use only: \*\*\*\*\*\*Are procedural/form changes required based on changes/actions approved during this meeting? (select one)YES\* [x]  NO [ ] \*If yes, the following information is required: |
| Documents requiring revision: | Who is responsible: | Due date: |
| AC7140 | J Aston | 01-Aug-2016 |
| OP1116 APP MMM | J Aston | 01-Aug-2016 |